www.nature.com/jim

(II)

# ABE production from corn: a recent economic evaluation

N Qureshi and HP Blaschek

Biotechnology and Bioengineering Group, Department of Food Science and Human Nutrition, University of Illinois, 1207 West Gregory Drive, Urbana, IL 61801 USA

This article details an economic assessment of butanol production from corn using the newly developed hyperbutanol-producing strain of *Clostridium beijerinckii* BA101. Butanol is produced in batch reactors and recovered by distillation. For a plant with 153,000 metric tons of acetone, butanol, and ethanol (ABE) production capacity, the production equipment cost and total working capital cost is US\$33.47×10<sup>6</sup> and US\$110.46×10<sup>6</sup>, respectively. Based on a corn price ( $C_p$ ) of US\$79.23 ton<sup>-1</sup> (US\$2.01 bushel<sup>-1</sup>), an ABE yield of 0.42 (g ABE/g glucose) butanol price is projected to be US\$0.34 kg<sup>-1</sup>. An improved yield of 0.50 will reduce this price to US\$0.29 kg<sup>-1</sup>. Assumptions, such as by-product credit for gases and complete conversion of corn steep liquor (CSL) to fermentation by-products, have been taken into consideration. An increased price of corn to US\$197.10 ton<sup>-1</sup> would result in a butanol price of US\$0.47 kg<sup>-1</sup>. A grass-rooted plant would result in a butanol price of US\$0.73 kg<sup>-1</sup> ( $C_p$  US\$79.23 ton<sup>-1</sup>). In a worst case scenario, the price of butanol would increase to US\$1.07 kg<sup>-1</sup> ( $C_p$  197.10 ton<sup>-1</sup> for a grass-rooted plant and assuming no credit for gases). This is based on the assumption that corn price would not increase to more than US\$197.10 ton<sup>-1</sup>. *Journal of Industrial Microbiology & Biotechnology* (2001) **27**, 292–297.

Keywords: corn; Clostridium beijerinckii BA101; acetone-butanol-ethanol (ABE); yield; capital cost; plant; corn steep liquor (CSL); fermentation

#### Introduction

Butanol is an important industrial chemical which is currently produced by either the oxo process starting from propylene (with  $H_2$  and CO over a rhodium catalyst) or the aldol process starting from acetaldehyde [24]. Acetone, a co-product of butanol fermentation, is produced chemically either by the cumene hydroperoxide process or the catalytic dehydrogenation of isopropanol [12]. In either case, these synthetic routes have proven to be economically advantageous in comparison to the fermentation-based processes. For this reason, all butanol/acetone fermentation facilities around the world have ceased. This happened after World War II when rapid development of the petrochemical industry took place.

In 1996, the worldwide annual production of butanol and acetone was  $2.49 \times 10^9$  and  $2.10 \times 10^9$  kg, respectively. The total production of acetone and butanol was achieved by chemical process using petroleum-based raw materials. Since 1990, production of butanol has been constant in the United States at  $1.17 \times 10^9$  kg, while worldwide butanol production has fluctuated slightly. Acetone and butanol production by regions of the world is shown in Table 1 [4].

Butanol has several applications in the chemical industry and as a fuel (Table 2). Butanol contributes to clean air by reducing emissions and unburned hydrocarbons in the tail pipe exhaust. Butanol has research and motor octane numbers of 113 and 94 compared to 111 and 92 for ethanol [6]. Some of the advantages of butanol as a fuel have been reported in the literature [6] including a vapor pressure for pure butanol of 0.63 psi as compared to 2.25 psi for ethanol, and a heat of vaporization of 141.3 kcal kg<sup>-1</sup> for butanol

compared to 204.1 kcal kg<sup>-1</sup> for ethanol. Additionally, the high boiling point (118°C) and lower vapor pressure for butanol may affect cold starting. It is more miscible with gasoline and diesel fuel, has a lower vapor pressure, and is less miscible with water. It is currently used as a feedstock chemical in the plastic industry and as a food grade extractant in the food and flavor industry (Table 2). Because of the potential for carcinogen carryover, the use of the petroleum-derived butanol is not desirable for food applications [3].

A recent decision of Oil and Petroleum Exporting Countries (OPEC) to reduce oil output has resulted in dramatic fluctuations in oil prices, which have soared to over US\$30 a barrel. Occasional price hikes (since 1973) and instability in the oil supply region have threatened its supply. As a result of a 1973 price increase, research has been focused on developing technology to produce fuels and chemicals from renewable resources. Since then, new microbial cultures, which can produce fuels more efficiently, have been developed. Additionally, various problems associated with the production of fuels and chemicals from natural resources have been solved. New methods of production and separation have been developed. We have reached a time when fermentation-derived chemicals can compete economically with petroleum-based and chemically manufactured fuels and chemicals.

Butanol can be produced from various commercial raw materials including molasses, whey permeate, and corn [5]. *Clostridium acetobutylicum* or *C. beijerinckii* can be used in this fermentation. In a typical butanol fermentation, acetone and ethanol are also produced along with butanol. The typical ratio of acetone, butanol, and ethanol (ABE) is 3:6:1 with maximum concentration of total solvents being 20 g  $1^{-1}$  when using traditional strain/s and traditional batch fermentation processes. *C. beijerinckii* BA101, a hyper-butanol-producing strain which is able to produce up to 33 g  $1^{-1}$  total solvents, was developed [2]. This culture is unique relative to other cultures in that it can produce and tolerate higher concentration of butanol and its use results in higher ABE yields. Additionally, *C. beijerinckii* BA101 starts producing butanol during

Correspondence: N Qureshi, Department of Food Science and Human Nutrition, Biotechnology and Bioengineering Group, University of Illinois, 1207 W Gregory Drive, Urbana, IL 61801, USA

Received 12 September 2000; accepted 12 January 2001

Table 1 World production of acetone and butanol by region (1996 data)

Region	Butanol (kg)	Acetone (kg)	
North America (Total)	$1.17 \times 10^{9}$	$1.21 \times 10^{9}$	
North America (USA only)	$1.17 \times 10^{9}$	$1.20 \times 10^{9}$	
South America	$5.12 \times 10^{7}$	$8.52 \times 10^{7}$	
Asia	$4.30 \times 10^{8}$	$4.76 \times 10^{8}$	
Europe	$8.43 \times 10^{8}$	$3.31 \times 10^{8}$	
Total	2.49×10 <sup>9</sup>	2.10×10 <sup>9</sup>	

the active growth phase, which results in improved productivity. *C. beijerinckii* BA101 has been studied extensively for its fermentation characteristics and has been used in pilot plant reactors [13].

The raw materials mentioned above may require upstream processing depending upon the process being used for fermentation [22]. Molasses require dilution and removal of sediments in order to remove minerals, whey permeate requires concentration possibly by reverse osmosis, while corn requires de-branning, de-germing/de-oiling, milling, sieving, centrifugation, and saccharification [26]. Our culture, *C. beijerinckii* BA101, is hyper-amylolytic and can hydrolyze starch efficiently to release glucose for fermentation to ABE. Corn contains 13-14% moisture, 4.5% oil, and 75% starch in addition to fiber, protein and ash [10] (Eckhoff and Ping Yang, personal communication).

The objective of the present paper was to report on the cost estimation of butanol production from corn using traditional technology and the hyper-butanol-producing *C. beijerinckii* BA101. Unless stated, the fermentation facility would be annexed to an existing corn milling plant.

## Materials and methods

# Fermentation, substrate, plant size, and product recovery

Batch fermentation was considered for the present studies. The medium and process used for fermentation have been reported previously [13,14]. The medium contained corn steep liquor (CSL), which is an inexpensive nutrient source. In order to prepare fermentation medium, 1 vol of CSL containing 100 g  $l^{-1}$  solids was added to 5 vol of starch solution. The culture, *C. beijerinckii* BA101, and CSL have been tested in our pilot plant reactors. For the purpose of this model, ABE would be recovered by distillation and four distillation columns would be required. It is assumed that recovered water will be recycled to the fermentation plant for medium preparation. After fermentation is complete, cells will be

Table 2 Applications of acetone and butanol

Acetone

Manufacture of: methyl isobutyl ketone, methacrylates, methyl butanol, bisphenyl A, methyl isobutylcarbinol, isophorone, and diacetone alcohol Solvent for: paints, lacquers, resins, nitrocellulose, varnishes, various processing, and cellulose acetate

#### Butanol

Manufacture of: dibutyl phthalate (as a precursor), butyl acetate (as a precursor), butyl acrylate (as a latex), glycol ethers, and amine resins Other uses: is an excellent fuel (it is miscible with gasoline and diesel fuel, has high calorific value, has a lower vapor pressure, and is less miscible with water); used in plastic industry as a feedstock chemical; food grade extractant; a solvent in the manufacture of oil, pharmaceuticals, perfumes [25]; and as a solvency enhancer in the formation of nitrocellulose lacquers

removed from the broth by centrifugation, refrigerated, and sold as cattle feed. It is assumed that fermentation gases will be compressed and sold. Cost for gas compression and storage has not been included. Similarly, cost for the storage of by-products has not been included in this exercise. Figure 1 shows a schematic diagram of butanol fermentation and recovery by distillation. The substrate (corn) would be purchased at US\$79.23 ton<sup>-1</sup> (US\$2.01 bushel<sup>-1</sup>) and processed in the milling section of the plant. A plant size of 153,000 metric tons of total ABE is being considered here of which butanol represents 121,596 metric tons. Unless stated otherwise, an ABE yield ( $Y_{p/s}$ ) of 0.42 (based on glucose) has been considered for this exercise.

#### Financial investment and assumptions

Standard chemical engineering texts were used for design purposes [15,27]. The equipment list has been adapted from a previous publication [16] and cost has been updated to July 2000 per the Chemical Engineering Index. It is assumed that capital is borrowed at an interest rate of 9%, Federal taxes are paid at 35% on profit, and the rate of return on investment is 20%. The fermentors and alkali tank (for pH adjustment) are constructed of stainless steel while the remainder of the plant is composed of carbon steel. The working life of the plant is 15 years with a straight line depreciation. A lang factor (a factor which is multiplied to the equipment cost to get total capital investment) of 3, which is an appropriate factor for an annexed plant, has been used unless stated. ABE productivity on the order of 0.38-0.39 g  $1^{-1}$  h<sup>-1</sup> has been assumed for this exercise. Our typical batch reactors result in reactor productivities of 0.35-0.50 g  $1^{-1}$  h<sup>-1</sup>. The number of working days is considered to be 350 days year<sup>-1</sup>. Fermentation gases (CO<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>) will be sold for by-product credit. CSL has been assumed to be a no-cost nutrient source. This plant, being an extension of the existing corn milling plant, would not require site development. All the prices are factory gate prices and do not include transportation costs. It has been assumed that CSL would be utilized completely by the culture. Suspended solids would be removed by centrifugation while dissolved solids would be separated by membrane. The recovered solids would be sold as cattle feed.

#### **Results and discussion**

The total equipment cost for batch fermentation and distillative recovery was estimated to be US $33.47 \times 10^6$  (Table 3). A base case price for butanol has been calculated to be US0.34 kg<sup>-1</sup> (Table 4). The current reported price for petrochemically derived butanol is US1.21 kg<sup>-1</sup> [1]. For the present plant, the total annual butanol production was calculated to be 121,596,230 kg for a total



Figure 1 A schematic diagram of butanol production by fermentation of corn (corn starch) and recovery by distillation. Stream (1) containing dissolved solids is directed to membrane section to recover solids and recycle water to the plant.

production cost of US\$106.1×10<sup>6</sup>. For the plant, total fixed capital investment was calculated to be US\$100.42×10<sup>6</sup>, while the total capital investment would be US\$110.46×10<sup>6</sup>. Total direct and indirect expenses were calculated to be US\$59.35×10<sup>6</sup> and US\$23.00×10<sup>6</sup>, respectively. The general expenses were calculated to be US\$23.74×10<sup>6</sup> which included administration, profit, and federal taxes. At a corn price ( $C_p$ ) of US\$79.23 ton<sup>-1</sup>, credit for

Table 3 Major equipment for ABE fermentation and recovery

294

	US\$
Corn wet milling	
Corn storage	216,762
Steeping tank	352,868
Grinding mill	248,923
Sieving (to remove fiber)	10,082
Centrifuge (to separate gluten)	1,133,513
Starch tank	250,536
Pumps (three)	65,734
ABE fermentation	254,280
Seed vessels (three)	354,280
Medium preparation tank	449,655
Fermentors	2,359,175
Cell centrituge	1,624,403
Pumps (five)	96,283
ABE recovery	
Reboiler (four)	11,165,755
Heat exchanger (four)	6.212.394
Distillation column (four)	8,116,068
Storage tank (three)	648.975
Pump (12)	166.655
Total	33.472.061

by-products was calculated to be US $64.55 \times 10^6$ . After by-product credit, net yearly production expenses were US $41.54 \times 10^6$ .

Table 5 shows material input and output for the butanol fermentation plant. For the plant,  $5.14 \times 10^8$  kg corn containing 14% moisture would be bought at US\$79.23 ton <sup>-1</sup>, unless otherwise stated. This amount of corn would result in the production of  $3.65 \times 10^8$  kg of glucose following hydrolysis. During processing and fermentation,  $5.75 \times 10^8$  kg of feed material (including CSL solids) would be fed to the system. The total amount of product (butanol 121,596,230 kg) and by -products (446,707,210 kg) would amount to  $5.68 \times 10^8$  kg. Approximately  $7 \times 10^6$  kg of raw material would be lost during processing, which is 1.22% of the total feed material. It should be noted that a significant amount of by -products is approximately four times that of the product (butanol).

In order to calculate by-products credit, acetone and ethanol prices were obtained from Chemical Marketing Reporter [1]. These prices were US\$0.38 and US\$0.28 kg<sup>-1</sup>, respectively. Prices for cell mass, fiber/protein, and recovered polysaccharide were assumed to be US\$0.18 kg<sup>-1</sup> (Ping Yang, personal communication). The credit that would be obtained from the plant is shown in Table 6. The above price of butanol is based on the assumption that US\$1×10<sup>6</sup> would be required for wastewater treatment ( $W_{wt}$ ) and water recycle [16]. However, if this assumption is increased to US\$3×10<sup>6</sup>, butanol price would increase to US\$0.36 kg<sup>-1</sup>. If gases are not recovered, then the butanol price would increase to US\$0.53 kg<sup>-1</sup> ( $W_{wt}$  US\$1×10<sup>6</sup>).

It has been our prior experience that the cost of substrate has the greatest effect on fuel/butanol price [8,20–22]. Prices of agricultural commodities often fluctuate and it would not be a surprise if the corn price increased in the future. An increased corn price of US\$197.10 ton<sup>-1</sup> (US\$5 bushel<sup>-1</sup>) has also been

**Table 4** Total manufacturing expenses and capital investment for a butanol plant  $(121.6 \times 10^6 \text{ kg year}^{-1})$ 

Total purchased equipment cost $33,472,061$ Fixed capital $100,416,184$ Working capital $10,041,618$ Total capital investment $110,457,803$ Manufacturing expenses $2000$ Direct expenses $40,724,220$ Operating labor $1,500,000$ Supervisory and clerical labor $225,000$ Utilities $40,724,220$ Steam $6,232,000$ Electricity $4,655,000$ Water $172,500$ Water $10,00,000$ Maintenance and repair $4,016,647$ Operating supplies $602,497$ Laboratory charges $225,000$ Total direct expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $9,941,202$ Local taxes $1,004,162$ Insurance $5,020,809$ Depreciation $7,029,133$ Interest $9,941,202$ Total indirect expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $23,741,796$ Administration $140,000$ Research and development $5,000,000$ Annual profit after tax $15,048,517$ Total general expenses $23,741,796$ Total manufacturing expenses $23,741,796$ Total manufacturing expenses $106,089,966$ By - products credit $64,550,200$ Net and production (kg) $121,596,230$ Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> ) $0.34$	Capital investment	US\$
Manufacturing expensesDirect expensesRaw materials $40,724,220$ Operating labor $1,500,000$ Supervisory and clerical labor $225,000$ Utilities $6,232,000$ Electricity $4,655,000$ Water $172,500$ Water $172,500$ Water $1,72,500$ Water $1,000,000$ Maintenance and repair $4,016,647$ Operating supplies $602,497$ Laboratory charges $225,000$ Total direct expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $5,020,809$ Depreciation $7,029,133$ Interest $9,941,202$ Total indirect expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $22,995,306$ Administration $140,000$ Research and development $500,000$ Annual profit after tax $15,048,517$ Federal tax $8,054,279$ Total general expenses $23,741,796$ Total manufacturing expenses $106,089,966$ By-products credit $64,550,206$ Net manufacturing expenses $41,539,761$ Total butanol production (kg) $121,596,230$ Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> ) $0.34$	Total purchased equipment cost Fixed capital Working capital Total capital investment	33,472,061 100,416,184 10,041,618 110,457,803
Direct expensesRaw materials $40,724,220$ Operating labor $1,500,000$ Supervisory and clerical labor $225,000$ Utilities $225,000$ Steam $6,232,000$ Electricity $4,655,000$ Water $172,500$ Waste water treatment $1,000,000$ Maintenance and repair $4,016,647$ Operating supplies $602,497$ Laboratory charges $225,000$ Total direct expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $22,900,809$ Depreciation $7,029,133$ Interest $9,941,202$ Total indirect expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $23,741,796$ Total general expenses $23,741,796$ Total general expenses $23,741,796$ Total manufacturing expenses $106,089,966$ By - products credit $64,550,206$ Net manufacturing expenses $41,539,761$ Total butanol production (kg) $121,596,230$	Manufacturing expenses	
Raw materials $40,724,220$ Operating labor1,500,000Supervisory and clerical labor225,000Utilities $6,232,000$ Electricity $4,655,000$ Water172,500Waste water treatment1,000,000Maintenance and repair $4,016,647$ Operating supplies $602,497$ Laboratory charges225,000Total direct expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $5,020,809$ Depreciation $7,029,133$ Interest $9,941,202$ Total indirect expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $23,741,796$ Total general expenses $23,741,796$ Total general expenses $23,741,796$ Total manufacturing expenses $106,089,966$ By-products credit $64,550,206$ Net manufacturing expenses $41,539,761$ Total butanol production (kg) $121,596,230$	Direct expenses	
Operating labor   1,500,000     Supervisory and clerical labor   225,000     Utilities   3     Steam   6,232,000     Electricity   4,655,000     Water   172,500     Waste water treatment   1,000,000     Maintenance and repair   4,016,647     Operating supplies   602,497     Laboratory charges   225,000     Total direct expenses   59,352,864     Indirect expenses   59,352,864     Indirect expenses   5,020,809     Depreciation   7,029,133     Interest   9,941,202     Total indirect expenses   22,995,306     General expenses   22,995,306     General expenses   23,741,796     Administration   140,000     Research and development   500,000     Annual profit after tax   15,048,517     Federal tax   8,054,279     Total general expenses   23,741,796     Total manufacturing expenses   106,089,966     By-products credit   64,550,206     Net manu	Raw materials	40,724,220
Supervisory and clerical labor 225,000   Utilities 6,232,000   Electricity 4,655,000   Water 172,500   Water 1,72,500   Waste water treatment 1,000,000   Maintenance and repair 4,016,647   Operating supplies 602,497   Laboratory charges 225,000   Total direct expenses 59,352,864   Indirect expenses 59,352,864   Local taxes 1,004,162   Insurance 5,020,809   Depreciation 7,029,133   Interest 9,941,202   Total indirect expenses 22,995,306   General expenses 22,995,306   General expenses 23,741,796   Administration 140,000   Research and development 500,000   Annual profit after tax 15,048,517   Federal tax 8,054,279   Total general expenses 106,089,966   By-products credit 64,550,206   Net manufacturing expenses 106,089,966   By-products credit 64,550,206   Net manufacturing expenses<	Operating labor	1,500,000
UtilitiesSteam $6,232,000$ Electricity $4,655,000$ Water $172,500$ Waste water treatment $1,000,000$ Maintenance and repair $4,016,647$ Operating supplies $602,497$ Laboratory charges $225,000$ Total direct expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $59,352,864$ Local taxes $1,004,162$ Insurance $5,020,809$ Depreciation $7,029,133$ Interest $9,941,202$ Total indirect expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $8,054,279$ Total general expenses $23,741,796$ Total general expenses $23,741,796$ Total manufacturing expenses $106,089,966$ By - products credit $64,550,206$ Net manufacturing expenses $41,539,761$ Total butanol production (kg) $121,596,230$ Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> ) $0.34$	Supervisory and clerical labor	225,000
Steam $6,232,000$ Electricity $4,655,000$ Water $172,500$ Waste water treatment $1,000,000$ Maintenance and repair $4,016,647$ Operating supplies $602,497$ Laboratory charges $225,000$ Total direct expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $5,020,809$ Depreciation $7,029,133$ Interest $9,941,202$ Total indirect expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $3,04,162$ Administration $140,000$ Research and development $500,000$ Annual profit after tax $15,048,517$ Federal tax $8,054,279$ Total general expenses $23,741,796$ Total manufacturing expenses $106,089,966$ By - products credit $64,550,206$ Net manufacturing expenses $41,539,761$ Total butanol production (kg) $121,596,230$ Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> ) $0.34$	Utilities	
Electricity $4,655,000$ Water $172,500$ Waste water treatment $1,000,000$ Maintenance and repair $4,016,647$ Operating supplies $602,497$ Laboratory charges $225,000$ Total direct expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $5,020,809$ Depreciation $7,029,133$ Interest $9,941,202$ Total indirect expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $8,054,279$ Total general expenses $23,741,796$ Total general expenses $23,741,796$ Total manufacturing expenses $106,089,966$ By -products credit $64,550,206$ Net manufacturing expenses $41,539,761$ Total butanol production (kg) $121,596,230$ Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> ) $0,34$	Steam	6,232,000
Water172,500Waste water treatment1,000,000Maintenance and repair4,016,647Operating supplies $602,497$ Laboratory charges225,000Total direct expenses59,352,864Indirect expenses1,004,162Insurance5,020,809Depreciation7,029,133Interest9,941,202Total indirect expenses22,995,306General expenses22,995,306General expenses22,995,306General expenses30,000Annual profit after tax15,048,517Federal tax8,054,279Total general expenses23,741,796Total manufacturing expenses106,089,966By - products credit64,550,206Net manufacturing expenses41,539,761Total butanol production (kg)121,596,230Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> )0,34	Electricity	4,655,000
Waste water treatment $1,000,000$ Maintenance and repair $4,016,647$ Operating supplies $602,497$ Laboratory charges $225,000$ Total direct expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $1,004,162$ Insurance $5,020,809$ Depreciation $7,029,133$ Interest $9,941,202$ Total indirect expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $500,000$ Annual profit after tax $15,048,517$ Federal tax $8,054,279$ Total general expenses $23,741,796$ Total manufacturing expenses $106,089,966$ By-products credit $64,550,206$ Net manufacturing expenses $41,539,761$ Total butanol production (kg) $121,596,230$	Water	172,500
Maintenance and repair $4,016,647$ Operating supplies $602,497$ Laboratory charges $225,000$ Total direct expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $1,004,162$ Insurance $5,020,809$ Depreciation $7,029,133$ Interest $9,941,202$ Total indirect expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $3,00,000$ Annual profit after tax $15,048,517$ Federal tax $8,054,279$ Total general expenses $20,741,796$ Total manufacturing expenses $106,089,966$ By-products credit $64,550,206$ Net manufacturing expenses $41,539,761$ Total butanol production (kg) $121,596,230$ Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> ) $0,34$	Waste water treatment	1,000,000
Operating supplies $602,497$ Laboratory charges $225,000$ Total direct expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $59,352,864$ Local taxes $1,004,162$ Insurance $5,020,809$ Depreciation $7,029,133$ Interest $9,941,202$ Total indirect expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $8,054,279$ Total general expenses $23,741,796$ Total general expenses $106,089,966$ By-products credit $64,550,206$ Net manufacturing expenses $41,539,761$ Total butanol production (kg) $121,596,230$ Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> ) $0,34$	Maintenance and repair	4,016,647
Laboratory charges225,000Total direct expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses $1,004,162$ Insurance $5,020,809$ Depreciation $7,029,133$ Interest $9,941,202$ Total indirect expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses $8,054,279$ Total general expenses $23,741,796$ Total manufacturing expenses $106,089,966$ By - products credit $64,550,206$ Net manufacturing expenses $41,539,761$ Total butanol production (kg) $121,596,230$ Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> ) $0,34$	Operating supplies	602,497
Total direct expenses $59,352,864$ Indirect expenses1,004,162Insurance5,020,809Depreciation7,029,133Interest9,941,202Total indirect expenses22,995,306General expenses22,995,306General expenses500,000Administration140,000Research and development500,000Annual profit after tax15,048,517Federal tax8,054,279Total general expenses23,741,796Total manufacturing expenses106,089,966By - products credit64,550,206Net manufacturing expenses41,539,761Total butanol production (kg)121,596,230Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> )0,34	Laboratory charges	225,000
Indirect expensesLocal taxes1,004,162Insurance5,020,809Depreciation7,029,133Interest9,941,202Total indirect expenses22,995,306General expenses22,995,306General expenses500,000Annual profit after tax15,048,517Federal tax8,054,279Total general expenses23,741,796Total general expenses106,089,966By-products credit64,550,206Net manufacturing expenses41,539,761Total butanol production (kg)121,596,230Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> )0,34	Total direct expenses	59,352,864
Local taxes 1,004,162   Insurance 5,020,809   Depreciation 7,029,133   Interest 9,941,202   Total indirect expenses 22,995,306   General expenses   Administration 140,000   Research and development 500,000   Annual profit after tax 15,048,517   Federal tax 8,054,279   Total general expenses 23,741,796   Total general expenses 106,089,966   By-products credit 64,550,206   Net manufacturing expenses 41,539,761   Total butanol production (kg) 121,596,230   Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> ) 0.34	Indirect expenses	
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllll$	Local taxes	1,004,162
Depreciation7,029,133Interest9,941,202Total indirect expenses22,995,306General expenses22,995,306Administration140,000Research and development500,000Annual profit after tax15,048,517Federal tax8,054,279Total general expenses23,741,796Total general expenses106,089,966By - products credit64,550,206Net manufacturing expenses41,539,761Total butanol production (kg)121,596,230Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> )0,34	Insurance	5,020,809
Interest9,941,202Total indirect expenses22,995,306General expenses22,995,306Administration140,000Research and development500,000Annual profit after tax15,048,517Federal tax8,054,279Total general expenses23,741,796Total general expenses106,089,966By - products credit64,550,206Net manufacturing expenses41,539,761Total butanol production (kg)121,596,230Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> )0.34	Depreciation	7,029,133
Total indirect expenses $22,995,306$ General expenses140,000Research and development500,000Annual profit after tax15,048,517Federal tax8,054,279Total general expenses23,741,796Total general expenses106,089,966By - products credit64,550,206Net manufacturing expenses41,539,761Total butanol production (kg)121,596,230Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> )0,34	Interest	9,941,202
General expensesAdministration140,000Research and development500,000Annual profit after tax15,048,517Federal tax8,054,279Total general expenses23,741,796Total manufacturing expenses106,089,966By-products credit64,550,206Net manufacturing expenses41,539,761Total butanol production (kg)121,596,230Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> )0.34	Total indirect expenses	22,995,306
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllll$	General expenses	
Research and development500,000Annual profit after tax15,048,517Federal tax8,054,279Total general expenses23,741,796Total manufacturing expenses106,089,966By-products credit64,550,206Net manufacturing expenses41,539,761Total butanol production (kg)121,596,230Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> )0.34	Administration	140,000
Annual profit after tax $15,048,517$ Federal tax $8,054,279$ Total general expenses $23,741,796$ Total manufacturing expenses $106,089,966$ By-products credit $64,550,206$ Net manufacturing expenses $41,539,761$ Total butanol production (kg) $121,596,230$ Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> ) $0.34$	Research and development	500,000
Federal tax $8,054,279$ Total general expenses $23,741,796$ Total manufacturing expenses $106,089,966$ By-products credit $64,550,206$ Net manufacturing expenses $41,539,761$ Total butanol production (kg) $121,596,230$ Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> ) $0.34$	Annual profit after tax	15,048,517
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllll$	Federal tax	8,054,279
Total manufacturing expenses $106,089,966$ By-products credit $64,550,206$ Net manufacturing expenses $41,539,761$ Total butanol production (kg) $121,596,230$ Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> ) $0.34$	Total general expenses	23,741,796
By - products credit $64,550,206$ Net manufacturing expenses $41,539,761$ Total butanol production (kg) $121,596,230$ Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> ) $0.34$	Total manufacturing expenses	106,089,966
Net manufacturing expenses $41,539,761$ Total butanol production (kg) $121,596,230$ Butanol production cost (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> ) $0.34$	By-products credit	64,550,206
Total butanol production (kg) $121,596,230$ Butanol production cost (US\$ kg $^{-1}$ ) $0.34$	Net manufacturing expenses	41,539,761
Butanol production cost (US\$ $kg^{-1}$ ) 0.34	Total butanol production (kg)	121,596,230
	Butanol production cost (US\$ kg $^{-1}$ )	0.34

considered. It has been assumed that the prices of by-products such as fiber and protein, germ/oil, polysaccharide, and cell mass will increase in the same proportion as the price of corn. This approach appears to be more realistic than using the increased price of corn alone. With an increased corn price of US\$197.10 ton<sup>-1</sup>, by-products credit would be US\$109.71×10<sup>6</sup> resulting in butanol price of US\$0.47 kg<sup>-1</sup> ( $W_{wt}$  US\$1×10<sup>6</sup>).

ABE yield and ratio of ABE are the important characteristics of the mutant strain C. beijerinckii BA101. We have consistently achieved ABE yields ranging from 0.40 to 0.50 [3], which is much higher than that reported for C. actobutylicum [9]. At this stage, we do not know where the alterations have occurred in the metabolic pathways of C. beijerinckii BA101. However, it is interesting to note that amounts and ratios of fermentation product and by-products, such as acetone, ethanol, and gases, are different than for other clostridial strains. Assuming a yield of 0.50 together with the typical solvent ratios we observed for this strain, the amount of ABE this culture would produce would be on the order of 182,240 tons year<sup>-1</sup> (Table 7). In addition to 144,610 tons of butanol per year, 28,470 tons of acetone per year and 9,160 tons of ethanol per year would be produced. The amount of butanol C. beijerinckii BA101 produces is much higher than the amount produced by C. acetobutylicum. C. acetobutylicum produces more gases and less solvents. The amounts of the product and byproducts (and by-product credit) which these two cultures would produce are shown in Table 7. It is interesting to note that butanol produced by *C. beijerinckii* BA101 is projected to cost US\$0.29 kg<sup>-1</sup>, while butanol produced by *C. acetobutylicum* is projected to cost US\$0.50 kg<sup>-1</sup> ( $C_p$  US\$79.23 ton<sup>-1</sup>,  $Y_{p/s}$  0.42, and  $W_{wt}$ US\$1×10<sup>6</sup>).

A grass-rooted plant would be more expensive to start because of expenses involved with development of site, offsite facilities, and auxiliary buildings. For such a plant, the total capital investment would be five times that of the total equipment cost. This would increase the price of butanol dramatically from US\$0.34 kg<sup>-1</sup> to US\$0.73 kg<sup>-1</sup> ( $C_p$  US\$79.23 ton<sup>-1</sup>,  $W_{wt}$  US\$1×10<sup>6</sup>). A combination of grass-rooted plant and US\$197.10 ton<sup>-1</sup> corn would result in a butanol price of US\$0.88 kg<sup>-1</sup> ( $W_{wt}$  US\$3×10<sup>6</sup>). In a worst case scenario, if no credit for gases is taken, then this price would increase to US\$1.07 kg<sup>-1</sup>.

The by-product prices are given in Table 6. Cell mass and corn fiber would be sold as a cattle feed at US\$0.18 kg<sup>-1</sup>. It should be noted that if CO<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub> are separated economically and sold as pure gases, then the price of butanol would be reduced significantly. A price of US\$0.50 lb<sup>-1</sup> for pure H<sub>2</sub> has been reported in the literature [6]. Moreira [11] discussed the chemical conversion of fermentation offgases to methanol and stated that a discounted cash flow rate of return of 25–30% is likely to be achieved for realistic operating conditions of a methanol synthesis plant co-located next to an acetone–butanol fermentation facility capable of producing  $1.00 \times 10^8$  kg solvents year<sup>-1</sup>. The capacity of the plant described herein is 25% larger than suggested by this author.

Another important factor in the ABE fermentation is the economical recovery of solvents. Among several techniques investigated [7], pervaporation is more attractive because it separates ABE selectively from the broth and does not harm the culture. Pervaporation can be used with batch, fed-batch, as well as continuous culture operations. We have studied pervaporation extensively in our reactors in order to separate ABE [17–19]. The impact of using pervaporative recovery on butanol price for a similar capacity plant will be examined in future studies.

Carbon source (substrate) is converted into butanol and a number of by-products such as acetone, ethanol, cell mass, polysaccharide, and gases. For the material balance calculations, it has been assumed (unless otherwise stated) that 42% ( $Y_{p/s}$  0.42) of the carbon is

**Table 5** Material balance for the butanol fermentation plant  $(121.6 \times 10^6 \text{ kg year}^{-1})$ 

Material balance	20
Feed	
Corn	$5.14 \times 10^8$ kg <sup>a</sup> (moisture 14%) (this amount of corn will result in $3.32 \times 10^8$ kg starch or $3.65 \times 10^8$ kg glucose)
FeSO <sub>4</sub> ·7H <sub>2</sub> O	569 kg
NaOH	92,865 kg
Water	$5 \times 10^9$ l (total fermentation broth volume is $6 \times 10^9$ l) (most of the water is recycled water)
Products	
Butanol	121,596,230 kg
By - products <sup>a</sup>	446,707,210 kg

<sup>a</sup>See Table 6

Cost estimation of ABE production from corn N Oureshi and HP Blaschek

296

Table 6 Annual b	y-product credit	for a butanol	production plan	nt from corn using	C. beijerinckii BA101
------------------	------------------	---------------	-----------------	--------------------	-----------------------

By-products	By-product amount (kg)	Corn price US\$79.23 ton <sup>-1</sup>		Corn price US\$197.10 ton <sup>-1</sup>	
		By-product price (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> )	Credit (US\$)	By-product price (US\$ kg <sup>-1</sup> )	Credit (US\$)
Acetone	23,938,054	0.38	9,096,461	0.38	9,096,461
Ethanol	7,464,200	0.28	2,089,976	0.28	2,089,976
Gases	232,581,500	0.10	23,258,150	0.10	23,258,150
Fiber and protein	88,408,000	0.18	15,913,440	0.45	39,783,600
Germ/oil	19,891,800	0.40	7,956,720	1.00	19,891,800
Cell mass	42,130,000	0.18	7,583,400	0.45	18,958,500
Polysaccharide	32,293,660	0.18	5,812,859	0.45	14,532,147
Total	446,707,210		64,550,206		109,708,634

converted into ABE, 50% to gases, 5% to cell mass, 1% to maintenance energy, and 2% to other products such as acids and polysaccharides. These assumptions are based on previous findings that the cells require maintenance energy for metabolic activities [23]. It is also well known that the ABE fermentation process is a complicated process and several by-products appear in the fermentation broth which require some carbon for their production.

Production of butanol is a biological process. It should be noted that in a biological process, the concentration of products may vary from batch to batch. This may occur under identical fermentation conditions. The calculations for the present plant are based on a batch fermentation which produced more acetone and ethanol than previously reported [16]; hence, solvents produced in this process are more by 3,000 tons year<sup>-1</sup>. It should be noted that  $1 \times 10^9$  l of CSL containing 10% (100 g l<sup>-1</sup>) dry weight solids would be used. The total amount of solids added to the fermentation medium would be  $1 \times 10^8$  kg, which is a significant amount as compared to corn  $(5.14 \times 10^8 \text{ kg})$ . It has been assumed that all of the CSL solids would be converted into cell mass and by-products  $(50 \times 10^6 \text{ kg})$ gases,  $25 \times 10^6$  kg cell mass, and  $25 \times 10^6$  kg polysaccharide). This is in addition to the conversion of corn starch to various products mentioned above. Since CSL contains only limited amounts of sugar, their conversion into ABE has not been considered.

### Conclusion

Butanol can be produced at US $0.34 \text{ kg}^{-1}$  from corn at US79.23ton  $^{-1}$ . This price is based on a yield of 0.42 and an assumption that

Table 7 A comparison of amounts of fermentation products derived by C. beijerinckii BA101 versus C. acetobutylicum

$D \rightarrow 1(1)$		
Butanol (kg)	144,610,000	
Acetone (kg)	28,470,000	by - product credit
		US\$63,805,619
Ethanol (kg)	9,160,000	butanol price US\$0.29 kg <sup>-1</sup>
Gases (kg)	203,166,000	
$(50 \times 10^6 \text{ kg from CS})$	SL)	
C. acetobutylicum, ABI	E yield 0.30	
Butanol (kg)	65,640,000	
Acetone (kg)	32,820,000	by - product credit
	- ,,	US\$73 254 565
Ethanol (kg)	10,940,000	butanol price US $0.50 \text{ kg}^{-1}$
Gases (kg)	276,103,460	

gases will be captured, compressed, and sold for by-product credit. For a butanol plant of 121,596,230 kg year  $^{-1}$  capacity, by - product credit would be US $64.55 \times 10^6$ . The total capital investment for this plant would be US $110.46 \times 10^6$ . If gases are not captured, then the butanol price would increase to US\$0.53 kg<sup>-1</sup>. Increasing the corn price to US\$197.10 ton<sup>-1</sup> would increase the butanol price to US\$0.47 kg<sup>-1</sup>. A grass-rooted plant would result in a price of US $3^{-1}$ . For this exercise, a rate of return and federal taxes have been assumed to be 20% and 35%, respectively. In a worst case scenario, the butanol price would increase to US $1.07 \text{ kg}^{-1}$ . In such a case, gases would not be captured, corn would be purchased at US\$197.10 ton<sup>-1</sup>, and the plant would be grassrooted. Throughout this exercise, it has been assumed that the CSL would be fully utilized and would be converted to cell mass, gases, and other by-products.

#### Acknowledgements

This work was supported by Illinois Corn Marketing Board grant ICMB 99-0124-02 Blaschek and ICMB Blaschek ANTC.

#### References

- 1 Chemical Marketing Reporter. 2000. 258(16) (October 16).
- 2 Chen CK and HP Blaschek. 1999. Acetate enhances solvent production and prevents degeneration in Clostridium beijerinckii BA101. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol 52: 170-173.
- 3 Formanek J. R Mackie and HP Blaschek. 1997. Enhanced butanol production by Clostridium beijerinckii BA101 grown in semidefined P2 medium containing 6 percent maltodextrin or glucose. Appl Environ Microbiol 63: 2306-2310.
- 4 Industrial Commodity Statistics. 1998. United Nations, New York, pp. 416, 423.
- 5 Jones DT and DR Woods. 1986. Acetone-butanol fermentation revisited. Microbiol Rev 50: 484-524.
- 6 Ladisch MR. 1991. Fermentation-derived butanol and scenarios for its uses in energy-related applications. Enzyme Microb Technol 13: 280 - 283.
- 7 Maddox IS. 1989. The acetone-butanol-ethanol fermentation: recent progress in technology. Biotechnol Genet Eng Rev 7: 189-220.
- Manderson GJ, K Spencer, AHJ Paterson, N Qureshi and DE Janssen. 8 1989. Price sensitivity of bioethanol produced in New Zealand from Pinus radiata wood. Energy Sources 11: 135-150.
- 9 Marlatt JA and R Datta, 1986. Acetone-butanol fermentation process development and economic evaluation. Biotechnol Prog 2: 23-28.
- 10 Mistry A. 1991. Alkali debranning for corn wet and dry milling and characterization of the end products. PhD Thesis, University of Illinois, Urbana, IL, USA.
- 11 Moreira AR. 1983. Acetone-butanol fermentation. In: Wise DL (Ed.),

Organic Chemicals from Biomass. The Benjamin/Cummings Publishing, Menlo Park, CA, pp. 385–406.

- 12 Nelson DL and BP Webb. 1979. Kirk–Othmer Encyclopedia of Chemical Technology, 3rd ed., Vol. I. John Wiley, New York, pp. 179–190.
- 13 Parekh M, J Formanek and HP Blaschek. 1999. Pilot scale production of butanol by *Clostridium beijerinckii* BA101 using a low-cost fermentation medium based on corn steep water. *Appl Microbiol Biotechnol* 51: 152–157.
- 14 Parekh M, J Formanek and HP Blaschek. 1998. Development of a cost-effective glucose-corn steep medium for production of butanol by *Clostridium beijerinckii* BA101. J Ind Microbiol Biotechnol 21: 187–191.
- 15 Peters MS and KD Timmerhaus. 1991. Plant Design and Economics for Chemical Engineers, 4th ed. McGraw-Hill, New York.
- 16 Qureshi N and HP Blaschek. 2000. Economics of butanol fermentation using hyperbutanol producing *Clostridium beijerinckii* BA101. *Trans Inst Chem Eng* 78 (Part C): 139–144.
- 17 Qureshi N and HP Blaschek. 2000. Butanol production using *Clostridium beijerinckii* BA101 hyper-butanol producing mutant strain and recovery by pervaporation. *Appl Biochem Biotechnol* 84: 5–15.
- 18 Qureshi N and HP Blaschek. 1999. Production of acetone butanol ethanol (ABE) by a hyper-producing mutant strain of *Clostridium beijerinckii* BA101 and recovery by pervaporation. *Biotechnol Prog* 15: 594–602.
- 19 Qureshi N and HP Blaschek. 1999. Fouling studies of a pervaporation membrane with commercial fermentation media and fermentation broth

of hyper-producing *Clostridium beijerinckii* BA101. *Sep Sci Technol* 34: 2803–2815.

- 20 Qureshi N and IS Maddox. 1992. Application of novel technology to the ABE fermentation process: an economic analysis. *Appl Biochem Biotechnol* 34: 441–448.
- 21 Qureshi N and IS Maddox. 1991. An economic assessment of the acetone-butanol-ethanol (ABE) fermentation process. *Aust J Biotechnol* 5: 56–59.
- 22 Qureshi N and GJ Manderson. 1995. Bioconversion of renewable resources into ethanol: an economic evaluation of selected hydrolysis, fermentation, and membrane technologies. *Energy Sources* 17: 241–265.
- 23 Qureshi N, AHJ Paterson and IS Maddox. 1988. Model for continuous production of solvents from whey permeate in a packed bed reactor using cells of *Clostridium acetobutylicum* immobilized by adsorption onto bonechar. *Appl Microbiol Biotechnol* 29: 323–328.
- 24 Sherman PD. 1979. Kirk-Othmer Encyclopedia of Chemical Technology, 3rd ed., Vol. IV. John Wiley, New York, pp. 338–345.
- 25 Sherman PD. 1978. In: Mark HF, DF Othmer, CG Overberg and GT Seaberr (Eds.), Encyclopedia of Chemical Technology, Vol. IV. John Wiley, New York, p. 383.
- 26 Singh V and SR Eckhoff. 1996. Effect of soak time, soak temperature, and lactic acid on germ recovery parameters. *Cereal Chem* 73: 716– 720.
- 27 Ulrich GD. 1984. A Guide to Chemical Engineering Process Design and Economics. John Wiley, New York.